ARDEN EARLY MODERN DRAMA

EARLY MODERN GERMAN SHAKESPEARE: *HAMLET* AND *ROMEO AND JULIET*

William Shakespeare
Der Bestrafte Brudermord and *Romio und Julieta*
in Translation

Edited by
LUKAS ERNE AND KAREEN SEIDLER
Advisory Editor: Professor Tiffany Stern,
the Shakespeare Institute, University of Birmingham, UK

THE ARDEN SHAKESPEARE
LONDON • NEW YORK • OXFORD • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

THE ARDEN SHAKESPEARE
Bloomsbury Publishing Plc
50 Bedford Square, London, WC1B 3DP, UK
1385 Broadway, New York, NY 10018, USA

BLOOMSBURY, THE ARDEN SHAKESPEARE and the Arden Shakespeare logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2020

Cover design: Charlotte Daniels
Cover image ©

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN: HB: 978-1-3500-8404-9
ePDF: 978-1-3500-8403-2
eBook: 978-1-3500-8402-5

Typeset by RefineCatch Limited, Bungay, Suffolk
Printed and bound in Great Britain

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.bloomsbury.com and sign up for our newsletters.

The Editors

Lukas Erne is Professor of English Literature at the University of Geneva. He is author of *Shakespeare as Literary Dramatist* (Cambridge, 2003). Professor Erne has taught at Lady Margaret Hall, Oxford, at the University of Neuchâtel and, as Visiting Professor, at Yale University.

Kareen Seidler holds a PhD from the University of Geneva and an MPhil from the University of Cambridge. Her MPhil thesis on *Romio und Julieta* was awarded the Martin-Lehnert-Award of the German Shakespeare Society.

CONTENTS

2.4 *Enter* HAMLET.

OPHELIA Your Highness, take back the jewel you gave me.
HAMLET What, girl, do you desire a husband? Get away from me – yet, come here. Listen girl, you maidens do nothing but seduce young lads; you buy your beauty from apothecaries and peddlers. Listen, I will tell you a story. There was a cavalier in Anjou, who fell in love with a lady, who, to look at, was like the goddess Venus. Now when they were to go to bed together, the bride went in first and began to undress. First she took out one eye, which had been set in artificially, then the front teeth made of ivory, which were also artificially made so that one could not see they were false. After

2.4 corresponds to 3.1.89–166 and 7.138–200 (the 'nunnery' sequence). The early positioning of the nunnery sequence agrees with Q1. The 'To be or not to be' soliloquy is absent from *BB*. Whereas in Q2/F only Ophelia is carrying a book, in Q1, both are reading at this point. In *BB*, references to books, letters and reading are less frequent than in Shakespeare.

1 As in Q1, Ophelia immediately comes to the point, trying to return the gift(s) Hamlet has given her. In Q2/F, she accosts Hamlet more formally: 'Good my lord, / How does your honour for this many a day?' (3.1.89–90). Q2/F's Ophelia returns unspecified 'remembrances' (3.1.92) and Q1's Ofelia unspecified 'tokens' (7.140), which are sometimes thought to be letters, whereas *BB*'s Ophelia returns a jewel. This is Ophelia's only speech in this scene.

2–20 *BB*'s Hamlet rails at women in general, not at Ophelia in particular. In Shakespeare, his attacks are more personal: 'I did love you once' (Q2/F, 3.1.114); 'I never loved you' (Q1, 7.160). He also wonders about Corambis'/Polonius' whereabouts: 'Where's your father?' (3.1.129; 'thy' in Q1).

6 **story** The first of two stories that Hamlet tells to illustrate a point he makes (the second begins at 2.7.79). Lope de Vega's *El mayor imposible* has been proposed as a possible source (Brennecke, 293), but the anecdote may have been widely known (Creizenach, 138). See also headnote to 2.2.

cavalier ('Kavalier') The word starts being used in German around the mid-seventeenth century (Creizenach, 143).

Anjou a region in the north-west of France. *BB*'s 'Anion' is clearly an error, occasioned by a misreading of 'u' for 'n'. The correct spelling, 'Anjou', appears in *ThK*.

9 **bride** An immediate consequence of having '[fallen] in love' (6–7, 'verliebte sich') seems to be marriage since the 'lady' (7, 'Dame') is next referred to as a 'bride' ('Braut'). This order of events is later stressed by Ophelia herself (3.11.17–8).

2.4.6 Anjou] *ThK*; Anion *BB*

which she washed herself; then the make-up, with which she had painted herself, also vanished. The bridegroom came at last and meant to embrace his bride, but when he caught sight of her, he was frightened, for he thought it was a ghost. Thus you deceive the bachelors. So listen to me, too. Yet wait, girl – but just go to a cloister, yet not to a cloister where two pairs of slippers stand at the bedside.

Exit.

[*King and Corambus step forward*.]

CORAMBUS Is he not perfectly and veritably mad, gracious lord and King?

KING Corambus, leave us; when we have need of you, we will send for you.

[*Exeunt*] *Corambus* [*and Ophelia*]. We have seen the Prince's madness and raving with great wonder, but it seems to us that this is not real

13 **make-up** In Shakespeare's 'nunnery sequence', Hamlet complains, 'I have heard of your paintings' (3.1.141; 'pratlings' in F); 'God hath given you one face, and you make yourselves another' (3.1.142–3).

17 **ghost** This word provides a suggestive connection to the play's literal ghost.

19 **cloister** In Shakespeare, Hamlet orders Ophelia to go to a 'nunnery' five times in Q2/F (3.1.120–48) and eight times in Q1 (7.163–94).

19–20 **yet . . . bedside** The adapter explicitly states what Shakespeare hints at with the mention of 'nunnery' (Freudenstein, 59; Wilson, 134). Since the allusion in 'nunnery' is not available in German, the adapter made efforts to explain its ramifications. See above, pp. 2–3.

19 **cloister** ('Kloster') Note the difference between 'Kloster' (a convent for monks or nuns) and 'nunnery'.

21–9 In contrast to Shakespeare, the subject of love has been dropped in *BB*, the chief interest being the veracity of Hamlet's madness, which the King clearly doubts.

24 SD *BB* gives no exit for Ophelia, but it seems likely that she leaves with her father. She might also leave at line 18, when Hamlet says 'Yet wait' ('Aber warte'). In Shakespeare, she has a short speech deploring Hamlet's state (3.1.149–60). In *BB*, no one takes notice of her after Hamlet has left. In Q2/F, Polonius addresses her again: 'You need not tell us what Lord Hamlet said – / We heard it all' (3.1.178–9).

20 SD2] *this edn*; *not in BB* 24 SD *Exeunt*, *and Ophelia*] *this edn*; *not in BB*

madness but a simulated madness. We must contrive to have him removed from here, if not from life, otherwise some harm may come of it. *Exit.*

2.5 *Enter* HAMLET *and* HORATIO.

HAMLET My worthy friend, Horatio, through this assumed madness I hope to find occasion to revenge my father's death. You know, however, that my father is surrounded by many guards at all times; so if things should go awry, and you should chance to find my dead body, have it honourably buried. At the first occasion that offers itself, I shall make an attempt on him.

HORATIO I entreat your Highness to do no such thing. Perhaps the ghost has deceived you.

HAMLET O, no, his words were spoken all too clearly. I can put my trust in him. But what news is the old fool bringing?

27–8 **We . . . life** In Q2/F the King decides that Hamlet 'shall with speed to England' (3.1.168), but the idea of having him killed is not mentioned until later (see 4.3.56–66). In Q1, there is no sign of either plan. Instead Corambis decides 'I will myself go feel him' (7.202), and the course of action joins that of Q2/F at 2.2.168.

2.5 has no direct equivalent in Shakespeare. Instead there is the fishmonger episode (2.2.168–214, 7.203–31) and the arrival of Rosencrantz and Guildenstern, who in turn announce the players' arrival (2.2.215–305, 7.232–83). F has an additional passage in which Hamlet calls Denmark 'a prison' (2.2.238–67, 242). Q1 and F further mention the children's companies, but only F elaborates on the topic (7.271–3; 2.2.335–60).

2–3 **father** The first 'father' ('Vater') refers to Hamlet's real father, the second to his uncle. This juxtaposition seems deliberate but might confuse an audience.

3–4 **my . . . guards** An illustration of this is Q2/F's King calling for his 'Switzers' (Q2, 4.5.97; F, 4.1.96) when he feels threatened by Laertes. See also *BB*, 5.1.5–7. Since Hamlet's procrastination is largely omitted from *BB*, 'the German play needs to stress th[e] hindrance' which the King's entourage represents (Bullough, 23).

9 Cf. Shakespeare's Hamlet: 'The spirit that I have seen / May be a de'il' (2.2.533–4).

12 Horatio remains silent until the end of 2.7 when Hamlet speaks to him again. There are no exit or entrance SDs for him.

2.6 *Enter* CORAMBUS.

CORAMBUS News, news, gracious sir! The comedians have arrived.

HAMLET When Marius Roscius was a comedian in Rome, what a fine time that was!

CORAMBUS Ha, ha, ha! Your Highness is always teasing me.

HAMLET O Jeptha, Jeptha, what a fair daughter you have!

CORAMBUS Your Highness always talks about my daughter.

HAMLET Well, old man, let the master of the comedians come in.

CORAMBUS It shall be done. *Exit.*

HAMLET These comedians come at the right time, for through them I shall test whether or not the ghost has told the truth. I once saw a tragedy where one brother

2.6 corresponds to Shakespeare's 2.2.317–58 and 7.284–316 (Polonius/Corambis announces the players).

3 **Marius Roscius** The correct spelling appears in *ThK*. *BB*'s 'Marus Russig' has occasioned a good deal of speculation (see, e.g., Latham, 97–8; Evans, *BB*, 60). Brennecke proposes that 'Marus Russig' means 'Marus the blackface', since 'rußig' means 'sooty' (267). The origin of 'Marius' is unclear. Duthie, unconvinced by Latham's argument that it derives from the 'Sextus Roscius *Amerinus*' of Cicero, held that 'Some ignoramus may simply have inserted a Latin name he happened to know in order to give Roscius a *praenomen*, even though it was the wrong one' (267). The Roman actor's full name is Quintus Roscius, and the name is simply 'Rossius' in Q2/F ('Rossios' in Q1). For another attempt at solving the crux, see Furness, 2.119.

7 **Jeptha** as in Shakespeare, referring to the judge of the Old Testament (Judges 11.30–40) who had to sacrifice his virgin daughter. Shakespeare's Hamlet quotes from a ballad that tells the biblical story (2.2.343–4).

8–9 In Q2/F this line is an ellipsis, recalling the earlier 'still harping on my daughter' (2.2.184–5).

13–18 In Shakespeare, Hamlet only articulates this idea after the players have left, although it must have occurred to him while speaking to them since he asks them to play *The Murder of Gonzago* (2.2.474).

13–15 **for . . . truth** A few lines earlier, Hamlet insisted on the Ghost's honesty (2.5.10–11).

15 **tragedy** Hamlet later asks the players to perform a 'Comödie' (2.7.20, 'comedy'), which could refer to a play in general. Later, Hamlet and Carl are even less specific, referring to 'this . . . piece' (2.7.61, 'diese Materie').

2.6.3 Marius Roscius] *ThK*; Marus Russig *BB*

murders the other in the garden; this they shall act. If the King turns pale, then he has done what the ghost told me.

2.7 *Enter* COMEDIANS *and Prinzipal* CARL.

CARL May the gods always bestow blessings, happiness and health on your Highness.

HAMLET I thank you, my friend; what do you desire?

CARL Your Highness, please graciously pardon us; we are foreign High German comedians and we hoped to have had the good fortune to act at his Majesty the King's wedding. But fortune turned her back on us while the contrary wind turned its face towards us. We therefore ask your Highness' leave to perform a story, so that we shall not have made our long journey entirely in vain.

2.7 is equivalent to Shakespeare's 2.2.359–540, 7.317–435 (the players' arrival) and 3.2.1–43, 9.1–40 (the advice to the players). Lines 75–102 correspond to 2.2.523–40, 7.427–35 (Hamlet discusses how theatrical performances can elicit confessions) and to 3.2.50–85, 9.42–62 (Hamlet asks Horatio to observe the King). Characteristically, *BB* strings together all the scenes involving the players. The play within the play follows in 2.8. This scene may describe the performance conditions seventeenth-century itinerant players encountered at court.

0 SD ***Prinzipal*** CARL equivalent to the unnamed 'Player' in Shakespeare ('1. Player' in F). For '*Prinzipal*', see above, p. 125.

3 **what . . . desire?** In Shakespeare, Hamlet demands something from the players: 'a taste of your quality. Come, a passionate speech' (2.2.369–70).

5 **foreign . . . comedians** In Shakespeare, the players seem to be known at court since they are 'the tragedians of the city' (2.2.292). In Denmark 'High German comedians' would indeed have been 'foreign' ('fremd'). The designation 'High German comedians' ('hochteutsche Comödianten') came into use towards the mid-seventeenth century, probably in contrast to the Dutch actors (cf. Creizenach *Schauspiele*, xiii).

8 **contrary** ('contraire') a Gallicism or an Anglicism.
contrary wind See also 5.2.11.

10 **story** (Historie) Hamlet uses the same word for the two stories he tells (2.4.6–17, 2.7.79–96). Carl does not mean a history play but a play in general. The word is also used to refer to a play in the epilogue to *Comedia von der schönen Sidea* (Act 5, in Cohn, *Germany*, 75).

10–11 **so . . . vain** a frequent argument used in petitions (see Limon, 61).

Shakespeare

Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group

ISSN: 1745-0918 (Print) 1745-0926 (Online) Journal homepage: https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/rshk20

Newly Discovered Shakespeare Passages in *Bel-vedére or The Garden of the Muses* (1600)

Lukas Erne & Devani Singh

To cite this article: Lukas Erne & Devani Singh (2020) Newly Discovered Shakespeare Passages in *Bel-vedére or The Garden of the Muses* (1600), Shakespeare, 16:1, 14-22, DOI: 10.1080/17450918.2018.1548501

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/17450918.2018.1548501

SHAKESPEARE
2020, VOL. 16, NO. 1, 14–22
https://doi.org/10.1080/17450918.2018.1548501

Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group

Newly Discovered Shakespeare Passages in *Bel-vedére or The Garden of the Muses* (1600)

Lukas Erne and Devani Singh

English Department, Faculty of Humanities, University of Geneva, Geneva 4, Switzerland

This article is an offshoot of work towards an edition of *Bel-vedére or The Garden of the Muses*, a printed commonplace book published in 1600. The editors' comprehensive analysis of the origins of the 4,482 one- or two-line passages has resulted in the discovery of thirteen hitherto untraced passages that are based on Shakespeare (and of a fourteenth passage whose Shakespearean origins were discovered by the scholar Charles Crawford in the early twentieth century but not published). These passages and their Shakespearean source texts in *Romeo and Juliet, Love's Labour's Lost, Richard II, Richard III, Venus and Adonis*, and *The Rape of Lucrece* are discussed here and serve to illustrate the range of adaptive strategies used in the compilation of the commonplace book. Three additional passages which have perhaps been adapted from Shakespeare source texts, including one of his sonnets, are also discussed. Discussion of the Shakespearean presence in *Bel-vedére* is contextualised by a brief account of prior work on the commonplace book and the attempted identification of its origins.

Keywords
Bel-vedere; *commonplace book*; *Romeo and Juliet*; *Richard II*; *Venus and Adonis*; *Lucrece*; *Richard III*; *Love's Labour's Lost*; *Sonnets*

Bel-vedére or The Garden of the Muses is an early modern printed commonplace book consisting of 4,482 one- or two-line quotations of decasyllabic verse, arranged under topical headings, including well over two hundred quotations of William Shakespeare and of Edmund Spenser, and over 50 of Christopher Marlowe. It appeared in octavo format in 1600 (STC 3189) and received a second edition, also in octavo, in 1610, with the title *The Garden of the Muses* (STC 3190). The book is of exceptional importance for the early reception history of leading early modern authors such as Shakespeare, Spenser and Marlowe, for the late Elizabethan practice of commonplacing, for the rising status of English literature (including dramatic literature), and for early modern English canon formation.

The importance of *Bel-vedére* has long been recognised, and the appearance of passages by early modern authors in it is often recorded and discussed. For instance, in his important multi-volume reference work, *British Drama 1533–1642: A Catalogue*, Martin Wiggins references all known quotations from plays in *Bel-vedére*.[1] Regularly, scholars writing about single authors refer to *Bel-vedére* as an indicator of that author's early reception: R.M. Cummings does so for Spenser (295–96), Anne Sweeney for Robert Southwell (17–18), and Edward Gieskes and Kirk Melnikoff for Robert Greene (110). C.M. Ingleby's *Shakspere Allusion-Book* devotes a separate appendix to *Bel-vedére*, and so do several single-play Shakespeare editions – for instance, William C. Carroll's New Cambridge edition of *Love's Labour's Lost* (200–02). Sasha Roberts has examined the uses to which *Romeo and Juliet* and *The Rape of Lucrece* are put in *Bel-vedére* ("Shakespeare's Tragedies of Love" 125–28; and *Reading Shakespeare's Poems in Early Modern England* 129–33), and Neil Rhodes has raised the question of

CONTACT Lukas Erne lukas.erne@unige.ch English Department, Faculty of Humanities, University of Geneva, 5 rue de Candolle, Geneva 4 1211, Switzerland

what *Bel-vedére* can tell us about Shakespeare's place in "the newly emerging literary canon" ("Shakespeare's Popularity and the Origins of the Canon" 114).

Considerable work has also been done to shed light on the genesis of *Bel-vedére*. The book belongs to a group of five printed prose and poetical commonplace books and miscellanies published in quick succession: *Politeuphuia, Wit's Commonwealth* (1597, STC 15685); *Palladis Tamia: Wit's Treasury* (1598, STC 17834), famous for its Shakespeare allusions; *Wit's Theater of the Little World* (1599, STC 381); *Bel-vedére* (1600); and, later in the same year, *England's Helicon* (STC 3191). They are sometimes referred to as the "Bodenham miscellanies" or "Bodenham anthologies", owing to their association with the grocer John Bodenham (*c.*1559–1610) – their "initiator, projector, and patron" – who collected the material printed in the five books during 'his extensive reading before handing it over to others for final arranging and editing' (Marotti; see also Williams). In the case of *Bel-vedére*, the editing appears to have been done by Anthony Munday (see Wright, "Anthony Mundy" and "Young Anthony Mundy"). Several of the Bodenham miscellanies show an explicit concern with English canon formation, most notably the famous "Comparatiue Discourse of our English Poets with the Greeke, Latine, and Italian Poets" in *Palladis Tamia* (see Allen). Neil Rhodes has called them "the first anthologies of English literature" (*Origins of English* 155) and has added elsewhere that "these volumes start to establish a national literary canon" ("Shakespeare's Computer" 253).

The importance of *Bel-vedére* for the status of English literature and the desirability of a fuller understanding of its make-up and literary context have been made clear in an important article by Zachary Lesser and Peter Stallybrass. In "The First Literary *Hamlet* and the Commonplacing of Professional Plays", they argue that *Bel-vedére* took a lead role in "transforming professional plays into poetry worthy of standing alongside classical authorities" (399), a project that other scholars (e.g. Brooks and Loewenstein) had associated almost exclusively with Ben Jonson. Lesser and Stallybrass's article builds on work by Stallybrass and Roger Chartier in which they argue that *Bel-vedére* is important for demonstrating that by 1600 modern vernacular poets were considered "suitable authorities on which to base an entire commonplace book" (48). It is in *Bel-vedére*, they suggest, that Shakespeare "emerges as a canonical English poet" (46). Whereas earlier printed commonplace books such as *Politeuphuia* and *Palladis Tamia* had used Christian and classical writers alongside a limited number of contemporary English writers, *Bel-vedére* confined its sources to contemporary English writers. That the importance of *Bel-vedére* for transforming the status of vernacular literature was recognised by early readers is suggested by the censorious treatment it received in the Cambridge play *The Second Part of the Return from Parnassus* (c. 1601/2, printed 1606) (see Lesser and Stallybrass 387–93; and Leishman). Stallybrass and Chartier's analysis builds on Ann Moss's assertion that for most of the sixteenth century "there is little evidence that vernacular literature (as distinct from vernacular translations, proverbs, and the sayings of important historical figures) had acquired sufficient status to be excerpted for commonplace-books, at least in print" (209). This starts to change, as Stallybrass and Chartier show, first under the impetus of *Politeuphuia* (1597) and *Palladis Tamia* (1598), then, and even more so, with *Bel-vedére*. *Bel-vedére* thus emerges from the work by Stallybrass, Lesser and Chartier as a key agent in the elevation of the status of English literature and the transformation of English plays into literature.

Given the undeniable importance of *Bel-vedére* and the presence of Shakespeare and other leading authors in it, it is surprising that it has not been edited in modern times. This is about to change since our edition, published by Cambridge University Press, is now forthcoming. The reason why no one else may have been tempted to undertake this labour before us is that *Bel-vedére*'s many passages are not assigned to their authors. A prefatory epistle "To the Reader" provides a list of purported authors whose works are supposed to have been drawn upon, but which, on close examination, turns out to be wholly unreliable.

The starting point for the making of a modern edition of *Bel-vedére* is the astounding scholarly work carried out by Charles Crawford in the early twentieth century. In 1913, Crawford published, with Oxford University Press, an edition of *England's Parnassus*, another printed commonplace book that had originally appeared in 1600, and which includes slightly longer verse quotations by

Shakespeare and others. By the time his edition of *England's Parnassus* was published, Crawford had long been working on an edition of *Bel-vedére*, also intended for publication by Oxford University Press (Crawford, letter to A.H. Bullen), which, however, he did not manage to complete.[2] Yet the work Crawford undertook was considerable and his scholarship formidable. In the early editions of 1600 and 1610, the sources of the 4,482 quotations that make up *Bel-vedére* are not spelled out, yet Crawford – long before the invention of digital search engines and thus working purely from his astounding memory and the editions and concordances at his disposal – managed to identify 2,380 of them. In an appendix to *The Shakspere Allusion-Book* (1909), he listed all the Shakespeare allusions he had traced, and in an article published in 1910/11, he provided a short introduction to the printed miscellany and indicated the number of quotations he had managed to identify from various authors, including Shakespeare, Edmund Spenser, Christopher Marlowe, George Chapman, Samuel Daniel, Michael Drayton, Robert Greene, Sir John Harington, Ben Jonson, Thomas Kyd, Thomas Lodge, John Lyly, John Marston, Thomas Middleton, Sir Philip Sidney, Robert Southwell, and so on (a total of thirty-eight authors). Yet Crawford's article does not identify the individual quotations and sources, only their total number, and the bulk of his labours on *Bel-vedére* are thus not in print. They have been preserved, however, in manuscript, namely on interleaved sheets inserted into an 1875 facsimile of *Bel-vedére*, now at the British Library (General Reference Collection C.116.e.14).

For our edition, we have undertaken a systematic investigation into the book's effaced sources. We have heavily relied on Crawford's papers in the first instance, and have checked all of his identifications – which are nearly always correct – using EEBO-TCP. We have checked all the remaining untraced excerpts – more than 2,000 – against EEBO-TCP as well. We have also relied on other methods of searching early modern corpora, including a sequence-matching algorithm that searches the corpus of untraced lines from *Bel-vedére* against the entirety of any uploaded text. Using these methods, we have been able to trace more than 1,150 additional lines in *Bel-vedére*. Although over 900 lines remain untraced, we now have a substantial pool of new data to add to Crawford's original counts.[3]

Much of the remainder of this article focuses on newly traced *Bel-vedére* lines that originate in Shakespeare. Before we move on to these newer discoveries, we will provide a brief summary of Crawford's Shakespeare identifications. In the appendix to the *Shakspere Allusion-Book*, he mentions the overall number of passages he has been able to trace to their sources ("about 1200") and adds that they include, he believes, "all those from Shakespeare" (Crawford, "Appendix D: J. Bodenham's *Belvedere*" 489). He goes on to quote all the Shakespeare-based passages in *Bel-vedére* along with their source texts (493–518). Their total number is 213, including ninety-one from *The Rape of Lucrece*, forty-seven from *Richard II*, thirty-four from *Venus and Adonis*, thirteen from *Richard III*, twelve from *Romeo and Juliet*, ten from the *True Tragedy of Richard Duke of York* (of which a different version is titled *The Third Part of Henry VI* in the First Folio), five from *Love's Labour's Lost*, and one from *The First Part of Henry IV*. Crawford added that he "believed Shakespeare to be the author of *Edward III*", at a time when few scholars did so, and he therefore added "a list of the quotations from *Edward III* … at the end" of his appendix (Crawford, "Appendix D: J. Bodenham's *Belvedere*" 493), of which he had identified twenty-three.

By the time of his article of 1910/11, Crawford could report that "out of the 4482 quotations in the book 2380 have been identified" (Crawford, "*Belvedere*" 202). His Shakespeare total had gone up from 213 to 214 (Crawford, "*Belvedere*" 204), including no longer twelve but "thirteen" from *Romeo and Juliet* (206), which means that the additional identification is from this play. Our work on Crawford's papers at the British Library has allowed us to ascertain which passage he managed to trace between the publication of the *Shakspere Allusion-Book* and his *Bel-vedére* article (see below).

The Newly Discovered Shakespeare Passages

In the course of our research, we have discovered thirteen previously untraced passages in *Bel-vedére* that originate in Shakespeare, one each from *Romeo and Juliet*, *Love's Labour's Lost*, and *Richard III*, two each from *Richard II* and *Venus and Adonis*, and six from *Lucrece*.

Romeo and Juliet

Bel-vedére, "Of Hope": "Sad hopes seeme ouer long and burdenous." (sig. C5v, QN 507).[4]

Shakespeare, *An Excellent conceited Tragedie of Romeo and Iuliet* (1597, STC 22322), "Ay me, sad hopes seeme long." (sig. B1v, 1.89).

Comment: In Q2, the line reads, "Ay me, sad houres seem long" (sig. B1r, 1.1.148). The choice to use Q1 over Q2 is consistent with most of Bodenham's passages from *Romeo and Juliet*.[5]

Love's Labour's Lost

Bel-vedére, "Of Fame and Infamie": "To know too much, is to know nought but fame." (sig. G5r, QN 1783).

Shakespeare, *A Pleasant Conceited Comedie called Loues labors lost* (1598, STC 22294), "Too much to know, is to know nought but fame:" (sig. A3r, 1.1.92).

Comment: The change in word order from "Too much to know" to "To know too much" is in keeping with Bodenham's practice elsewhere.

Richard III

Bel-vedére, "Of Flatterie, &c.": "Plaine, and not honest, is too harsh a style." (sig. M8r, QN 3412).

Shakespeare, *The tragedie of King Richard the third* (1597, STC 22314), "Plaine and not honest is to harsh a stile." (sig. K2v, 4.4.360).

Comment: Such verbatim quotation of the source text is common in *Bel-vedére*, but so are various forms of adaptation, as exemplified above and below.

Richard II

Bel-vedére, "Of the Mind": "What the tongue dares not, oft the mind doth say." (sig. L7v, QN 3086).

Shakespeare, *The Tragedie of King Richard the second* (1597, STC 22307), "What my tong dares not, that my heart shal say." (K1r, 5.5.97).

Comment: In a change that is typical of the process of commonplacing, the line in *Bel-vedére* changes the personally specific ("my tong", "my heart") to the generic ("the tongue", "the mind"). The change from "heart" to "mind" may have been dictated by the topical heading, "Of the Mind".

Bel-vedére, "Of Affection, &c.": "Bad mens affections, turne to feare and hate:/And hate, to daunger and deserued death." (sig. M1v, QN 3157).

Shakespeare, *Richard the second*, "The loue of wicked men conuerts to feare,/That feare to hate, and hate turnes one or both/To worthy daunger and deserued death." (sig. H3r, 5.1.66–68).

Comment: In adapting Shakespeare's passage, *Bel-vedére* condenses three lines to two, the self-imposed maximal length in Bodenham's commonplace book.

Venus and Adonis

Bel-vedére, "Of Thoughts": "*If springing thoughts be any iot diminisht,/They wither in their prime, and prooue nought worth.*" (sig. N5v, QN 3604).

Shakespeare, *Venus and Adonis* (1593, STC 22354), "If springing things be anie iot diminisht,/ They wither in their prime, proue nothing worth," (sig. D1v, ll. 417–18).

Comment: The change from "thoughts" to "things" makes the passage fit for inclusion under the topical heading "Of Thoughts".

Bel-vedére, "Of Teares, &c.": "Soft teares make batterie in the hardest heart." (sig. N7r, QN 3661)

Shakespeare, *Venus and Adonis*, "Dismisse your vows, your fained tears, your flattry,/For where a heart is hard they make no battry." (sig. D1v, ll. 425–26).

Comment: The adaptation reverses the sense. The passage in *Bel-vedére* distils Shakespeare's two lines into one, drops two of the three nouns in the first line ("vows" and "flattry") but preserves one ("tears"), keeps Shakespeare's alliteration while inverting the word order ("heart is hard"/"hardest heart"), eliminates the negative ("make no battry"/"make batterie""), preserves an adjective but adds the superlative ("hard"/"hardest"), and adds a key word, indeed starts the line with, it ("Soft"), the antonym of a word in the source ("hard"), so as to create an antithesis. While the verbal material is mostly borrowed or adapted from Shakespeare, the antithesis, which, rhetorically, is the main point of the line, is the adapter's invention, not Shakespeare's. Note that the previous passage (QN 3604) and two other passages in *Bel-vedére* (QN 602 and 608) are based on lines from the same page of *Venus and Adonis* (sig. D1v).

The Rape of Lucrece

Bel-vedére, "Of Kings and Princes": "Princes are glasses to their subiects eyes." (sig. E5r, QN 1154)

Shakespeare, *Lucrece* (1594, STC 22345), "For Princes are the glasse, the schoole, the booke,/Where subiects eies do learn, do read, do looke." (sig. E3v, ll. 615–16).

Comment: This and the following verse in *Bel-vedére* (see below) adapt the same two-line passage in *Lucrece*.

Bel-vedére, "Of Kings and Princes": "The liues of princes are their subiects bookes." (sig. E5r, QN 1155).

Shakespeare, *Lucrece*, "For Princes are the glasse, the schoole, the booke,/Where subiects eies do learn, do read, do looke." (sig. E3v, ll. 615–16).

Comment: See the comment on the preceding passage.

Bel-vedére, "Of Friendship, &c.": "*Looke what abuse is offer'd to a friend,/The shame and fault finds no excuse or end.*" (sig. G8r, QN 1876).

Shakespeare, *Lucrece*, "But as he is my kinsman, my deare friend,/The shame and fault finds no excuse nor end." (sig. C2v, ll. 237–38).

Comment: While the second line in *Bel-vedére* is almost identical with Shakespeare's (the only exception being "*or*"/"nor"), the first underwent adaptation for the purposes of commonplacing.

Bel-vedére, "Of Patience": "*They that loose halfe, with greater patience beare it,/Then they whose all, is swallowed in confusion.*" (sig. H2r, QN 1972).

Shakespeare, *Lucrece*, "They that loose halfe with greater patience beare it,/Then they whose whole is swallowed in confusion." (sig. H4v, ll. 1158–59).

Comment: The only significant difference is *Bel-vedére*'s substitution of "all" for "whole".

Bel-vedére, "Of Couetousnes, &c.": "*Couetous wretches doe such griefes sustaine,/That they prooue bankrupts in their greatest gaine.*" (sig. I8r, QN 2452).

Shakespeare, *Lucrece*, "Those that much couet … such griefes sustaine,/That they proue bãckrout in this poore rich gain." (sig. B4r, ll. 134–40).

Comment: The couplet in *Bel-vedére* draws on the beginning and the end of one of Shakespeare's rhyme royal stanzas. The whole stanza was included in *England's Parnassus* (1600, STC 378), sig. B6v.

Bel-vedére, "Of Life": "*Ill, compassing fit opportunitie,/Or kiles his life, or else lifes qualitie.*" (sig. Q2r, QN 4368).

Shakespeare, *Lucrece* (1594, STC 22345), "But ill annexed opportunity/Or kills his life, or else his quality." (sig. G1v, ll. 874–75).

Comment: The change from "his quality" to "lifes qualitie" in the second line seems to have been dictated by *Bel-vedére*'s topical heading, "Of Life". The passage was also included in *England's Parnassus* (1600, STC 378): "But ill annexed opportunities,/Or killes his life or else his qualitie. *W. Sh.*" (sig. V3r).

The following passage, adapted from *Romeo and Juliet*, was not included in Crawford's Appendix to the *Shakspere Allusion-Book* (1909), although Crawford appears to have been aware of it by the time he published the *Bel-vedére* article in *Englische Studien* in 1910/1911, and he recorded it in the manuscript notes interleaved into a copy of the 1875 Spenser Society reprint, now at the British Library (see above).

Bel-vedére, "Of Youth": "*It's often seen, that loue in young men lyes/Not truely in their hearts, but in their eyes.*" (sig. P6v, QN 4230).

Shakespeare, *Romeo and Juliet*, "Is Rosaline whome thou didst loue so deare/So soone forsook, lo yong mens loue then lies/Not truelie in their harts, but in their eyes." (Q1, D4v, 6.61–63).

Comment: Whereas Friar Laurence's comment in *Romeo and Juliet* arises from a specific situation, the adaptation in *Bel-vedére* stresses its commonplace nature ("*It's often seene*") and makes the couplet rhyme ("*lyes*"/"*eyes*"). The passage in Q2 ("Is *Rosaline* that thou didst loue so deare,/ So soone forsaken? yonng [*sic*] mens loue then lies/Not truly in their hearts, but in their eies.", sig. E1v) departs little from Q1's, and which text underlies the couplet in *Bel-vedére* thus seems impossible to determine (see also above).

Three Doubtful Passages

Apart from those recorded above, there are three passages whose relationship to Shakespeare seems to us intriguing without being of a nature that makes us confident that he is the creditor. In our edition, we therefore consider the passages as untraced. Nonetheless, for the sake of completeness they seem worth recording here, and also serve to illustrate the kind of judgement calls that are involved in the identification of *Bel-vedére*'s source texts. The first two passages are related to *The Rape of Lucrece*; the third, most interestingly, to one of Shakespeare's *Sonnets*.

Bel-vedére, "Of Pleasure, &c.": "As sad minds brooke no merrie companie,/So sorrow is to pleasure enemie." (sig. O6r, QN 3943).

Shakespeare, *Lucrece*: "Sad soules are slaine in merrie companie,/Griefe best is pleas'd with griefes societie;" (sig. H3v, ll. 1110–11).

Comment: The first line in *Bel-vedére* may echo the first line in *Lucrece*. They share the idea that "Sad soules"/"sad minds" do not enjoy "merrie companie". The couplet in *Bel-vedére* appears among a series of "*Similies on the same subiect*" (sig. O4v), i.e. on the subject of pleasure, which accounts for its "As … So" structure. However, although *Bel-vedére*'s "*Similies*" are often the result of some degree of adaptation, the present one would have an unusually distant relationship to its source. The passage in *Lucrece*, along with its adjacent lines, is highlighted in the early editions with commonplace markers. Line 1110, "Sad soules are slaine in merrie companie," (sig. H3v, l. 1110), is used verbatim in *Bel-vedére* for QN 2748 (K7v).

Bel-vedére: "Short walkes seeme long when sorrow metes the way." (sig. K8r, QN 2781).

Shakespeare, *The Rape of Lucrece* (1594, STC 22345), "Short time seems long, in sorrowes sharp sustayning," (sig. L2v, l. 1573).

Comment: The line in *Bel-vedére* shares the sense and several keywords with that in *Lucrece*, but it is unclear why it would have been adapted quite extensively rather than copied verbatim, or near-

verbatim. Shakespeare's line is included in *England's Parnassus* (1600, STC 378): "Short time seems long in sorrowes sharp sustaining, […] *W. Shakespeare.*" (sig. X1v).

Bel-vedére: "*Some men so striue in cunning to excell,/That oft they marre the worke before was well.*" (sig. E3v, QN 1110).

Shakespeare, Sonnet 103: "Were it not sinfull then striuing to mend,/To marre the subiect that before was well," (ll. 9–10).

Comment: The thought is commonplace (cf. Dent W260), but the specific form its expression takes in the two texts is in several ways parallel: both passages end with "before was well", and both employ "marre" and "striue"/"striuing".[6] Several of the differences could be accounted for by the process of commonplacing: *Bel-vedére*'s "*Some men*" and "*that oft*" are formulations that render the content more generally applicable. The word "*excell*", on the other hand, is a result of the rhyme, whereas lines 9 and 10 of Shakespeare's sonnet belong to its third cross-rhyming couplet and therefore do not rhyme. What we know about Bodenham's practice of commonplacing is not incompatible with the idea that he transformed the passage in Sonnet 103 in such a way as to produce QN 1110 in *Bel-vedére*. And what we know about the manuscript circulation and dating of Shakespeare's sonnets could be reconciled with the availability of (a version of) Sonnet 103 to Bodenham at the very end of the sixteenth century.[7] That Bodenham used manuscript poetry in assembling the material for *Bel-vedére* is stressed in the prefatory epistle "To the Reader" and borne out by our research.[8] However, since the case for the indebtedness of QN 1110 to Shakespeare's Sonnet 103 seems to us possible rather than certain, we consider the passage in *Bel-vedére* as untraced.

We conclude with the new totals of passages in *Bel-vedére* that can be traced to Shakespeare, noting parenthetically whether and, if so, how our numbers differ from Crawford's:

The First Part of Henry IV: 1 (+0)

Love's Labour's Lost: 6 (+1)

The Rape of Lucrece: 97 (+6)

Richard II: 49 (+2)

Richard III: 14 (+1)

Romeo and Juliet: 14 (+1)

The True Tragedy of Richard Duke of York: 10 (+0)

Venus and Adonis: 36 (+2)

More than a century after Crawford published his appendix in the *Shakspere Allusion-Book*, the belief that Shakespeare was involved in the writing of *Edward III* has become the majority opinion.[9] There is disagreement as to how much of the play Shakespeare composed, although most scholars now agree that he wrote the "Countess Scenes" (Scenes 2 and 3).[10] We thus consider passages drawn from these two scenes as Shakespeare's, and the rest of the play as anonymous. Remarkably, of the twenty-three passages drawn from the play, thirteen are from Shakespeare.

Edward III: 23 (+0), of which anon.: 10; Shakespeare: 13

If we include the passages from the "Countess Scenes" in *Edward III*, the number of quotations from or adapted from Shakespeare is thus 240.[11] This places him in second place in our list of the most frequently quoted authors in *Bel-vedére*, just ahead of Samuel Daniel and Edmund Spenser, and second only to Michael Drayton.[12]

Notes

1. For information about Shakespeare's presence in *Bel-vedére* that deserves to be updated with reference to the present article, see vol. 3, 1590–1597, pp. 225 (*R3*), 273 (*RJ*), 291 (*R2*), and 324 (*LLL*).
2. We are grateful to Adam Hooks for sharing his transcription of Crawford's letter with us.
3. Our forthcoming edition will provide detailed information, including a note for every one of the 4,482 passages, and a synthetic index and tables.
4. Our forthcoming edition assigns consecutive quotation numbers (QNs) to the 4,482 passages.
5. See Erne, ed., *The First Quarto of Romeo and Juliet* 166–67, and Crawford, "Appendix D: J. Bodenham's *Belvedere*" 492.
6. Shakespeare returns to the idea in *The History of King Lear*: "Striving to better aught, we mar what's well." ((1.4).330).
7. Sonnets 61–103 have been tentatively dated to the mid-1590s (see Colin Burrow, ed., *Complete Sonnets and Poems* 104–05). For the manuscript circulation of Shakespeare's sonnets, see Erne, "Manuscript and Print," 58, 62–64.
8. The address "To the Reader" mentions that passages have been excerpted "out of sundry things extant, and many in priuat" (sig. A4v). We have identified a number of quotations in *Belvedére* whose sources do not seem to have been in print by 1600, including several from a poem called "The Bee" which was likely written by Robert Devereux, Second Earl of Essex.
9. The play has been included in the New Cambridge Shakespeare series (1998, ed. Giorgio Melchiori), the second edition of the Oxford *Complete Works* (2005, gen. eds. Stanley Wells and Gary Taylor), the *New Oxford Shakespeare* (2016, gen. eds. Gary Taylor, John Jowett, Terri Bourus and Gabriel Egan) and the Arden 3 series (2017, eds. Richard Proudfoot and Nicola Bennett).
10. See Taylor and Loughnane (503–04). Since no similar consensus has so far emerged with regards to the authorship of *Arden of Faversham* (included in *The New Oxford Shakespeare* and in the RSC Shakespeare *Collaborative Plays* volume, ed. Bate and Rasmussen, but in no other recent Shakespeare edition or series), we do not count any of that play's ten passages in *Bel-vedére* as Shakespeare's. Four of the ten *Arden* passages are from the portions the editors of *The New Oxford Shakespeare* assign to Shakespeare (all from Scene 8).
11. *Titus Andronicus* and *The First Part of the Contention*, which both first appeared in 1594, are the only Shakespeare plays published before 1600 from which no passages seem to have found their way into *Bel-vedére*. Neither play was attributed to Shakespeare on the quarto title pages in the 1590s.
12. The exact figures for these and other authors will be supplied in our edition.

Disclosure Statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Funding

This work was supported by the Swiss National Science Foundation under Grant number 159255; Schweizerischer Nationalfonds zur Förderung der Wissenschaftlichen Forschung.

References

Allen, Don Cameron, ed. *Palladis Tamia*. New York: Scholars' Reprints, 1938. Print.

Bate, Jonathan, and Eric Rasmussen, eds. *The RSC Shakespeare: Complete Works, William Shakespeare and Others: Collaborative Plays*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 2013. Print.

Bodenham, John. *Bodenham's Belvedere; or, The Garden of the Muses*. Facsimile reprint. Publications of the Spenser Society No. 17. Manchester, 1875. Print.

Burrow, Colin, ed. *The Complete Sonnets and Poems*. Oxford: UP, 2002. Print.

Brooks, Douglas A. *From Playhouse to Printing House: Drama and Authorship in Early Modern England*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000. Print.

Carroll, William C., ed. *Love's Labour's Lost*. The New Cambridge Shakespeare. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2009. Print.

Crawford, Charles. "Appendix D: J. Bodenham's *Belvedere*." *Shakspere Allusion-Book*. Ed. C.M. Ingleby et al., 2 vols. London: Chatto & Windus, 1909. 2.489–518. Print.

Crawford, Charles. "*Belvedere, or, The Garden of the Muses*." *Englische Studien* 43 (1910-11): 198–228. Print.

Crawford, Charles, ed. *England's Parnassus*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1913. Print.

Crawford, Charles. letter to A.H. Bullen, PRO, DR 709/49, From C[harles] Crawford, Tottenham, London, to A. H. Bullen. 31 October 1913.
Crawford, Charles. manuscript notes interleaved in *Bodenham's Belvedere* (London, 1875), bound in two volumes, with a manuscript book, *Belvedere Quotations Arranged*, by Crawford, inserted in the second (British Library, General Reference Collection C.116.e.14).
Cummings, R.M., ed. *Edmund Spenser: The Critical Heritage*. London: Routledge, 1971. Print.
Dent, R.W. *Shakespeare's Proverbial Language: An Index*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1981. Print.
Erne, Lukas. "Manuscript and Print." *The Cambridge Companion to Shakespeare's Poetry*. Ed. Patrick Cheney. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2007, 54–71. Print.
Erne, Lukas, ed. *The First Quarto of Romeo and Juliet*. The New Cambridge Shakespeare. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2007. Print.
Gieskes, Edward, and Kirk Melnikoff, eds. *Writing Robert Greene: Essays on England's First Notorious Professional Writer*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008. Print.
Ingleby, C. M. et al. *The Shakspere Allusion-Book*, 2 vols. London: Chatto & Windus, 1909. Print.
Leishman, J.B., ed. *Three Parnassus Plays (1598–1601)*. London: Nicholson & Watson, 1949. Print.
Lesser, Zachary, and Peter Stallybrass, "The First Literary *Hamlet* and the Commonplacing of Professional Plays." *Shakespeare Quarterly* 59 (2008): 371–420. Print.
Loewenstein, Joseph. *Ben Jonson and Possessive Authorship*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2002.
Marotti, Arthur F. "Bodenham, John (c.1559–1610)." *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Web.
Moss, Ann. *Printed Commonplace-Books and the Structuring of Renaissance Thought*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996. Print.
Rhodes, Neil. "Shakespeare's Computer: Commonplaces/Databases." *The Shakespearean International Yearbook: Where Are We Now in Shakespearean Studies?* 3 (2003): 249–67. Print.
Rhodes, Neil. *Shakespeare and the Origins of English*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004. Print.
Rhodes, Neil. "Shakespeare's Popularity and the Origins of the Canon." *The Elizabethan Top Ten: Defining Print Popularity in Early Modern England*. Ed. Andy Kesson and Emma Smith. Farnham: Ashgate, 2013. 101–22. Print.
Roberts, Sasha. "Shakespeare's Tragedies of Love: *Romeo and Juliet*, *Othello*, and *Antony and Cleopatra* in Early Modern England." *A Companion to Shakespeare's Works: The Tragedies*. Ed. Richard Dutton and Jean E. Howard. Oxford: Blackwell, 2003. 108–33. Print.
Roberts, Sasha. *Reading Shakespeare's Poems in Early Modern England*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003. Print.
Stallybrass, Peter, and Roger Chartier. "Reading and Authorship: The Circulation of Shakespeare, 1590–1619." *A Concise Companion to Shakespeare and the Text*. Ed. Andrew Murphy. Oxford: Blackwell, 2007. 35–56. Print.
Sweeney, Anne R. *Robert Southwell: Snow in Arcadia: Redrawing the English Lyric Landscape, 1586–95*. Manchester: Manchester UP, 2006. Print.
Taylor, Gary, and Rory Loughnane. "The Canon and Chronology of Shakespeare's Works." *The New Oxford Shakespeare Authorship Companion*. Ed. Gary Taylor and Gabriel Egan. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2017. 417–602. Print.
Wiggins, Martin, in association with Catherine Richardson. *British Drama 1533–1642: A Catalogue*. 9 vols. published. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2011-2018. Print.
Williams, F.B. "John Bodenham, 'Art's Lover, Learning's Friend'." *Studies in Philology* 31 (1934): 198–214. Print.
Wright, C.T. "Anthony Mundy and the Bodenham Miscellanies." *Philological Quarterly* 40 (1961): 449–61. Print.
Wright, C.T. "Young Anthony Mundy Again", *Studies in Philology* 56 (1959): 150–68. Print.

BEL-VEDÉRE

OR

THE GARDEN OF THE MUSES

An Early Modern Printed Commonplace Book

EDITED BY

LUKAS ERNE

University of Geneva

DEVANI SINGH

University of Geneva

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107190023
DOI: 10.1017/9781316996775

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-19002-3 Hardback

The digital publication and the pre-print stage of the print publication of this book were prepared with the support of the Swiss National Science Foundation.

Contents

	QN	TLN
Which to preuent, she gladly slue her selfe. [D4v]	794	
Lucrece once rifled of her chastitie,		1100
Imagin'd following life, but infamie.	795	
Diripentina, by her fathers hands,		
Was done to death to saue her chastitie.	796	
Varro did hold the man religious,		
That made a conscience of his chastitie.	797	1105
Quintilian saith, That heauens chiefest gift		
Bestowed on man, is blessed chastitie.	798	

Of Beautie.

Beautie is Natures priuiledge, a close deceit,		
A short times tyrant, and vast Monarchie.	799	1110
Beautie but seldome seene, makes vs admire it.	800	
Beautie is such a bait, that (swallowed) choakes.	801	
Beauties best treasure, is the owners harme.	802	
Selfe-pleasing soules doe play with beauties baites.	803	
There is no name (if shee be false or not)		1115
But being faire, some enuious tongue will blot.	804	

794 Rogers, *Discourse*, 'We reade also of a Theban mayde, which being much allured vnto copulation by Nicanor, in whose power she was, for he had brought Thebes and all the inhabitantes thereof into seruitude, rather then she would graunt vnto his wicked request, tooke a sworde and slewe her selfe.' (R3r; prose).

795 Rogers, *Discourse*, 'This made Lucretia not for to care for this worlde, after that her boddie was once defiled.' (R2v; prose).

796 Rogers, *Discourse*, 'And therefore tooke a sworde, and killed her [Diripentina] whose Chastetie was his care,' (R3v; prose).

797 Rogers, *Discourse*, 'And therefore doth Varro take a chaste man, both for him that is religious, and godly man: and also for him whiche is an abstinent man, and him which is of good conuersation.' (R2r; prose).

798 untraced

799 *WC*, 'Of Beauty', 'Beauty is a tyrant for short time, the priueledge of nature, a close deceipt, and a solitarie kingdome.' (E4v; prose).

800 Drayton, *Epistles*, 'Edward the fourth to Shore's wife', 'And beauties sildome seene, makes vs admire them.' (H8r; vol. 2, 152).

801 Southwell, *Complaint*, 'What ioy to liue', 'Heere beauty is a baite that swallowed choakes,' (H4v; 19).

802 Southwell, *Complaint*, 'What ioy to liue', '[Beauty is] A treasure sought still to the owners harmes:' (H4v; 20).

803 Southwell, *Complaint*, 'Lewd loue is losse', 'Selfe-pleasing soules that play with beauties bayte,' (I3v; 25).

804 Marlowe and Chapman, *Hero* (Marlowe), 'Whose name is it, if she be false or not, / So she be faire, but some vile toongs will blot?' (B4v; 1.285–6).

	QN	TLN
Beautie doth varnish age, as if new borne.	805	
Where faire is not, no boot to paint the brow.	806	
Beautie being borrowed, merits no regard.	807	
[D5r]		
Simples fit beautie, fie on drugs or Art.	808	1120
Beautie doth sweetly quicken when 'tis nigh:		
But distant farre, murders, where 'tis belou'd.	809	
Seldome want guests where beautie bids the feast.	810	
Care and suspition is faire beauties dower.	811	
Beautie brings perill, wanting safe protection.	812	1125
Beautie at death can be bequeath'd to none.	813	
Were beautie vnder twentie lockes kept fast,		
Yet loue will through, and picke them all at last.	814	
Nice fooles delight to be accounted faire.	815	
Beautie is soonest lost, too choicely kept.	816	1130
Beautie to beautie alwaies is benigne.	817	
Beautie within it selfe should not be wasted.	818	
Bright beautie is the bait, which with delight,		
Doth most allure man to encrease his kind.	819	
Beautie and wealth are fraught with coy disdaine.	820	1135
Beautie is often with it selfe at strife.	821	
True beautie needs no other ornament.	822	

805 Shakespeare, *LLL*, 'Beautie doth varnish Age, as if new borne,' (F1v; 4.3.236).
806 Shakespeare, *LLL*, 'Where faire is not, praise cannot mend the brow.' (D2v; 4.1.17).
807 Lodge, *Metamorphosis*, 'For borrowed beauties, merit no regard:' (D2v; vol. 1, p. 32).
808 Drayton, *Endimion*, 'Simples fit beauty, fie on drugs and Art.' (B3v; *; vol. 1, 132).
809 Marlowe and Chapman, *Hero* (Marlowe), 'So beautie, sweetly quickens when t'is ny, / But being separated and remooued, / Burnes where it cherisht, murdrs where it loued.' (D3r; 2.610–12).
810 Drayton, 'Matilda', 'Seldom wants guests, where Beautie bids the feast,' (G1v; vol. 1, 227).
811 Drayton, 'Matilda', 'Care and Suspition is faire Beauties dower.' (G2r; vol. 1, 250).
812 Drayton, 'Matilda', 'Beautie brings perrill, wanting safe protection.' (H8v; vol. 1, 789).
813 Marlowe and Chapman, *Hero* (Marlowe), 'But this faire iem, sweet, in the losse alone, / When you fleet hence, can be bequeath'd to none.' (B3v; 1.247–8).
814 Shakespeare, *V&A*, 'Were beautie vnder twentie locks kept fast, / Yet loue breaks through, & picks them all at last.' (E1r, 575–6).
815 Marlowe and Chapman, *Hero* (Marlowe), 'Faire fooles delight to be accounted nice.' (C1r; 1.326).
816 Marlowe and Chapman, *Hero* (Marlowe), 'Beautie alone is lost, too warily kept.' (C1v; 1.328).
817 untraced
818 Shakespeare, *V&A*, 'Beautie within it selfe should not be wasted,' (B3v; 130).
819 Spenser, *Colin*, 'For beautie is the bayt which with delight / Doth man allure, for to enlarge his kind.' (E1v; vol. 1, 871–2).
820 Drayton, *Idea*, 'Beautie and wealth been fraught with hie disdaine,' (C2r; vol. 1, 2.136).
821 Barnfield, *Shepherd*, '(Beautie is often with it selfe at strife).' (D1v).
822 Daniel, *Cleopatra*, 'And that true beauty needes no ornament.' (L1v; vol. 3, 730).

	QN	TLN
Men praise the face, yet blame the flintie mind.	823	
The fairest flower of beautie fades away,		
Like the fresh Lillie in the Sun-shine day.	824	1140
Swift time makes wrinkles in the fairest brow.	825	
Faire women grieue to thinke they must be old.	826	
Pittie and smiles doe best become the faire.	827	
Beautie hath priuiledge to checke all dutie.	828	
All things that faire, that pure, and glorious been,		1145
Offer themselues on purpose to be seene.	829	
Alluring shewes most deepe impression strike.	830	
Sweetly it fits the faire to wantonnize.	831	
Nothing but crueltie misseemes the faire.	832	
Beautie is nothing if it be not seene.	833	1150
No greater corsiue to our blooming yeeres,		
Than the cold badge of winter-blasted haires.	834	
Beautie will be where is the most resort.	835	
[D5v]		
Beautie is mightie, yet her strength but weake.	836	
Beautie like Autumne fades and falls away.	837	1155
Beautie hath power to ouercome the strong.	838	

823 Daniel, 'To Delia', 'Ile praise her face, and blame her flinty hart.' (C4v; vol. 1, 26.12).
824 Spenser, *FQ*, 'And that faire flower of beautie fades away, / As doth the lilly fresh before the sunny ray.' (2H6r; vol. 2, III.vi.38.8–9).
825 Daniel, 'To Delia', 'Swift speedy Time, feathred with flying howers, / Dissolues the beautie of the fairest brow.' (D1v; vol. 1, 39.11–12).
826 Daniel, 'To Delia', 'And women grieue to thinke they must be olde.' (D7r; vol. 1, 50.14).
827 Daniel, 'To Delia', 'Pittie and smiles doe best become the faire.' (D7v; vol. 1, 51.11).
828 Daniel, 'Rosamond', 'Found well by proofe the priuiledge of Beautie, / That it had powre to counter-maund all duetie.' (I2v; vol. 1, 167–8).
829 Drayton, *Epistles*, 'King Iohn to Matilda', 'All things that faire, that pure, that glorious beene, / Offer themselues of purpose to be seene;' (C2v; vol. 2, 129–30).
830 Daniel, 'Rosamond', 'Alluring shewes most deepe impression strikes,' (K2r; vol. 1, 307).
831 Daniel, 'Rosamond', 'For sweetly it fits the faire to wantonise.' (K3v; vol. 1, 317).
832 Daniel, 'Rosamond', 'To shew that nothing ill becomes the fayre, / But cruelty, that yeeldes vnto no prayer.' (K4v; vol. 1, 405–6).
833 Daniel, 'Rosamond', 'For what is Beauty if it be not seene,' (L3r; vol. 1, 514).
834 Drayton, *Epistles*, 'The Epistle of Rosamond to King Henrie the second', 'No sharper corsiue to our blooming yeares, / Then the cold badge of winter-blasted haires.' (B1v–B2r; vol. 2, 39–40).
835 Daniel, 'Rosamond', 'For Beauty will be where is most resorting' (L3r; vol. 1, 525).
836 Ogle, *Troy*, 'Beautie is mightie: yet her strength but weake,' (B1r).
837 Turberville, *Tales*, 'And beuties buddes like fading floures do fall.' (T4v).
838 Spenser, *FQ*, 'O how can beautie maister the most strong,' (C2r; vol.2, I.iii.6.4).

	QN	TLN
Faire flowers that are not gathered in their prime,		
Rot and consume themselues in little time.	839	
The Summers beautie yeelds to winters blasts.	840	
By clouds of care best beauties are defac'd.	841	1160
Beautie being shamelesse, seemes a loathsome sight.	842	
Amongst faire Roses grow some stinking weeds.	843	
The fairer and more beautifull the skie,		
The ouglier seeme the clouds that in it lye.	844	
Nothing so soone allures as beautie doth.	845	1165
Religion is austere, but beautie mild.	846	
The fair'st in shew must carrie all away.	847	
At fairest signes, best welcome is surmiz'd.	848	
Beautie in heauen and earth this grace doth win,		
It supples rigor, and it lessens sinne.	849	1170
Dainties are made for tast, beautie for vse.	850	
Seeds spring from seeds, and beauty beauty breedeth.	851	
Beautie oft crazeth like a broken glasse.	852	
Both old and young, and all would fairest be.	853	
Hardly perfection is so absolute,		1175
But some impuritie doth it pollute.	854	

839 Shakespeare, *V&A*, 'Faire flowers that are not gathred in their prime, / Rot, and consume them selues in litle time.' (B3v; 131–2).
840 Baldwin, *Last Part*, 'The Sommers beautie yeldes to winters blast.' (R5v).
841 Turberville, *Tales*, 'By clowdes of care best beauties be defaste:' ([A]4v).
842 Spenser, *FQ*, 'So shamelesse beauty soone becomes a loathly sight.' (2C3v; vol. 2, III.i.48.9).
843 Spenser, *FQ*, 'Emongst the Roses grow some wicked weeds;' (2C4r; vol. 2, III.i.49.6).
844 Shakespeare, *R2*, 'Since the more faire and cristall is the skie, / The vglier seeme the cloudes that in it flie:' (A2v; 1.1.41–2).
845 Spenser, *FQ*, 'Nought vnder heauen so strongly doth allure / The sence of man, and all his minde possesse, / As beauties louely baite' (2S5r; vol. 3, V.viii.1.1–3).
846 *Edward III* (Shakespeare), 'Religion is austere and bewty gentle,' (C3v; 2.454).
847 Drayton, *Mortimeriados*, 'The fayr'st in show must carrie all away;' (C1v; vol. 1, 201).
848 Drayton, 'Matilda', 'At fairest signes, best welcome is surmiz'd.' (G1v; vol. 1, 229).
849 Marlowe and Chapman, *Hero* (Chapman), 'Beautie in heauen and earth this grace doth win, / It supples rigor, and it lessens sin.' (G4v; 3.395–6).
850 Shakespeare, *V&A*, 'Torches are made to light, iewels to weare, / Dainties to tast, fresh beautie for the vse,' (B4v; 163–4).
851 Shakespeare, *V&A*, 'Seeds spring fro*m* seeds, & beauty breedeth beauty,' (B4v; 167).
852 Drayton, 'Matilda', 'And beautie crazed, like a broken glasse:' (I5v; vol. 1, 935).
853 Chute, *Beauty*, 'Both old, and young and all would fairest be.' (B2r).
854 Shakespeare, *Lucrece*, 'But no perfection is so absolute, / That some impuritie doth not pollute.' (G1r; *; 853–4).

	QN	TLN
A small fault soone impaires the sweetest beautie.	855	
The verie fairest hath her imperfection.	856	
Beautie to dwell with woe, deformes it selfe.	857	
As fairest beautie fades, so loue growes cold.	858	1180
Beautie it selfe, doth of it selfe perswade		
The eyes of men, without an Oratour.	859	
If beautie were not, loue were quite confounded.	860	
The fairest flowers haue not the sweetest smell.	861	
The painted face sets forth no perfect blood.	862	1185
The beautie of the mind excels the face.	863	
Desire being Pilot, and bright beautie prize,		
[D6r]		
Who can feare sinking where such treasure lyes?	864	
Beautie is able sorrow to beguile.	865	
There's none so faire, whose beautie all respect.	866	1190
The fairest buds are soonest nipt with frosts.	867	
Who builds on beautie, builds but for a while.	868	
Beautie is euer held so much more faire,		
By how much lesse her hate makes loue despaire.	869	
That's quickly staind, which is the purest fine.	870	1195

855 Chute, *Beauty*, 'I knew a small fault quickly would impaire / The purest bewtie that should fall therein.' (B2v).
856 Chute, *Beauty*, 'For euen the fayrest hath her imperfection:' (C3r).
857 *Knack to Know*, 'Beautie to dwel with wo were to to bad.' (C2r).
858 Greene, *Mamillia*, 'verifying the saying of *Calimachis*, that as flowers fade and flourish euery yeare so there loue is hotte and cold euery houre,' (H4r; prose; vol. 2, p. 103).
859 Shakespeare, *Lucrece*, 'Beautie it selfe doth of it selfe perswade, / The eies of men without an Orator,' (B1v; 29–30).
860 untraced
861 Southwell, *Complaint*, 'Lewd Loue is Losse', 'The fairest flowers, haue not the sweetest smell,' (I3r; 23).
862 Churchyard, *Challenge*, 'A Warning to the Wanderers abroad, that seekes to sow dissention at home', 'The painted face, sets foorth no perfect blood.' (K4r).
863 Becon, *Jewel*, 'And looke howe muche the mynde excelleth the bodye, euen so muche doeth the beautye of the mynde excede the fayrnes of the face.' (I7v; prose).
864 Shakespeare, *Lucrece*, 'Desire my Pilot is, Beautie my prise, / Then who feares sinking where such treasure lies?' (C3v; 279–80).
865 Griffin, *Fidessa*, 'Sonnet XXVIII', '(Beautie is able sorrow to beguile.)' (C1v).
866 Brandon, *Octavia*, 'Ther's none so faire whose beautie all respect,' (E8v).
867 Meres, *Palladis*, 'Loue', 'As the fairest blossomes, are soonest nipt with frost; and the best fruite soonest touched with Caterpillers: so the ripest wittes are most apt to bee ouerthrowne by loue.' (S7r; prose).
868 Greene, *Mamillia*, 'for she that buyldes her loue vpon bewty, meanes to fancy but for a while:' (E4v; prose; vol. 2, p. 67).
869 untraced
870 Chute, *Beauty*, 'T'is quickly stayned is the purest fine.' (C1v).

	QN	TLN
In fairest stone small raine soone makes a print.	871	
Ill fare that faire which inwardly is foule.	872	
Beautie is inward vertue of the soule.	873	
We trample grasse, and prize the flowers in MAY,		
Yet grasse is greene, when fairest flowers decay.	874	1200
The loue of beautie, Reason quite forgets.	875	
The cause of loue is only beauties lookes.	876	
Beautie and youth once banisht, ne're returne.	877	
Chast thoughts makes beautie be immortallizd.	878	
Faire beautie is the sparke of hot desire,		1205
And sparkes in time will kindle to a fire.	879	
Sicknesse and age are beauties chiefest foes.	880	
Weeds oft times grow, when fairest flowers fade.	881	
Beautie is like a faire, but fading flower.	882	
Where beautie most abounds, there wants most ruth.	883	1210
The goodliest gemme being blemisht with a cracke,		
Looseth both beautie and the vertue too.	884	
Beautie doth whet the wit, makes bold the will.	885	
Beautie makes Art to worke beyond it selfe.	886	
Vnhonest beautie is a deadly poyson.	887	1215
Vertue-lesse beautie doth deserue no loue.	888	

871 Linche, *Diella*, 'In firmest stone small raine doth make a print,' (B5r).
872 Powell, *Leprosy*, 'Ill fare that outward faire that's inward foule,' (C1v).
873 *WC*, 'Of Vertue', 'Vertue is the beautie of the inward man.' (B6r; prose).
874 Southwell, *Complaint*, 'Scorne not the least', 'We trample grasse, and prize the flowers of May: / Yet grasse is greene, when flowers doe fade away.' (G1r; 24–5).
875 *WC*, 'Of Loue', 'The loue of beauty, is the forgetting of reason.' (C7v; prose).
876 *WC*, 'Of Loue', 'The cause of loue is delight, which by the aspect and sight of beauty is first taken;' (D3v; prose).
877 *WC*, 'Of Banishment', 'Beauty and youth once banished, neuer repeale.' (R3v; prose).
878 untraced
879 Parry, *Sinetes*, 'Sweete beautie is the sparke of my desire, / And sparkes in time may breede a flaming fier.' (G6r).
880 *WC*, 'Of Beauty', 'Beauty withereth with age, and is impaired by sicknes.' (E4v; prose).
881 Rogers, *Elegies*, 'Weeds long time growe, the fayrest flowres do fade' (C8v).
882 Rogers, *Elegies*, 'Beautie is like a faire but fading flower,' (D1v).
883 Tofte, *Alba*, 'An Answer to his kinde friend Richard Day. Gent.', 'Where Beautie most abounds, there wants most Ruth.' (A5v).
884 Greene, *Alcida*, 'The fairest Iem oft blemish with a cracke, / Loseth his beauty and his virtue too:' (H3r; vol. 9, p. 88).
885 Breton, 'Pilgrimage', 'It [beauty] whets the wit, and doth embolden will,' (E1v).
886 Breton, 'Pilgrimage', 'And maketh Arte to worke beyond her selfe,' (E1v).
887 *WC*, 'Of Beauty', 'Beauty without honesty, is like deadly poyson preserued in a boxe of gold.' (E5r; prose).
888 Delamothe, *French*, 'Beautie without vertue, doth not deserue to be loued.' (M4v; prose).

	QN	TLN
The fairest flower nipt with the winters frost,		
In shew seemes worser than the basest weed.	889	
The perfect glasse of vertue, beautie is.	890	
No bait so sweet as beautie, to the eye.	891	1220
White seemes the fairer when as blacke is by.	892	
[D6v]		
The purest Lawne is apt for euery staine.	893	
Better it is with beautie to be blinded,		
Than beauties graces should be blindly minded.	894	
Beautie is tearm'd the mistresse of delight.	895	1225
Beautie oft iniures them endued therewith.	896	
Beautie enflates and puffeth vp the mind.	897	
Humilitie with beautie seldome is.	898	
Beautie brings fancie to a daintie feast,		
And makes a man, that else were but a beast.	899	1230
Man of all creatures is most beautifull.	900	
Beautie not proud, nothing more excellent.	901	

Similies on the same subiect.

As the right Corall need no other grace,		
So Artlesse beautie best sets forth the face.	902	1235
As finest cloth will soonest catch a staine,		

889 Greene, *Alcida*, 'The fairest flower nipt with the winters frost, / In shew seemes worser then the basest weede.' (H3r; vol. 9, p. 88).
890 Delamothe, *French*, 'Beautie is the true glasse of diuine vertue.' (M4v; prose).
891 Whitney, *Emblems*, 'No baite so sweete as beautie, to the eie,' (T2r).
892 Spenser, *FQ*, 'As white seemes fairer, macht with blacke attone.' (2L1r; vol. 2, III.ix.2.4).
893 Drayton, 'Matilda', 'The purest Lawne, most apt for euery spot,' (G1v; vol. 1, 233).
894 Breton, *Delights*, 'Better it is with Bewtie to be blinded, / Then Bewties grace to be blindly minded.' (E3r).
895 untraced. Compare *EP*, 'The queene of Loue, the mistresse of delight' (N5v).
896 untraced
897 untraced
898 untraced
899 Breton, 'Pilgrimage', 'It [beauty] bringeth fancy to a deinty feast, / And makes a man, that woulde be els a beast.' (E1v).
900 Rogers, *Discourse*, 'because of all creatures none is beutifull, but onely man.' (L6v; prose; 'Beautie' printed in margin).
901 untraced
902 Meres, *Palladis*, 'Beautie', 'the right Corall needeth no coloring: so where beauty is perfect, there needeth no painting.' (V6r; prose).

	QN	TLN
So fairest lookes may shadow minds most vaine.	903	
As greatest feasts seldome can want fit friends,		
So beauties house will hardly lacke resort.	904	
As medlers with the fire are easily scorcht,		1240
So they that gaze on beautie soone are caught.	905	
As coldest Climates haue their Summer dayes,		
So coolest thoughts are fierd at beauties blaze.	906	
As that same Speare which harme must heale the wound,		
So looke where beautie kills, it must reuiue.	907	1245

Examples likewise on the same.

Hercules being a mightie conquerour,		
Yet vaild his courage at faire beauties feet.	908	
The Lybian Lyons loose their sternest might,		
If of a beauteous face they once get sight.	909	1250
The *Scandian* Lord, by nature dull and rude,		
By sight of beautie lost this seruitude.	910	
Alcestaes beautie made *Mæanders* Swannes,		
[D7r]		
To leaue the flood and on her shoulders pearch.	911	
Chrysippus held, that beautie did preserue		1255
Kindnes, and all societie with men.	912	
Zeno, the Prince of Stoickes did agree,		
That beautie, like could very hardly be.	913	

903 untraced
904 untraced
905 untraced
906 untraced
907 untraced
908 Allott, *WT*, 'Of Beauty', 'Hercules layd down his club at Iolaes feet, and became a prisoner to her conquering beauty. *Ouid.*' (L4r; prose).
909 de Pontaymeri, *Worth*, '*Timeus* the Scicillian reporteth that the Lions of Lybia loose their force and furie, if they haue neuer so little sight of a maidens eyes.' (B1v; prose).
910 de Pontaymeri, *Worth*, 'And *Bandello* witnesseth to vs in his histories, that a Lord of *Scandia*, being by nature dull and blockish; at the very first sight and regarde of a Lady of *Vicensa*, became discreetlie wise and well gouerned.' (B1v–B2r; prose).
911 untraced
912 untraced
913 untraced